

# HISTORY



SPRING 1994

Vol. 62, No. 2



# Cabin Religion in Vermont, 1724–1791

Yankee settlers in Vermont left their institutions behind them and built new ones slowly. By and large, these people were religious, though only a handful of them had formal places of worship. And even if the settlers wanted churches, most were glad to escape the restrictions of the established church in their former homes.

# By T. D. SEYMOUR BASSETT

rontier Vermont struck many observers as churchless. A woman who came to Springfield as a child in 1772 recalled that her father was called "bishop" because he read the sermons in the house where people gathered for public worship. The apparent lack of churches was one of the many things about the region that horrified Reverend Nathan Perkins, on leave from his West Hartford, Connecticut, parish in 1789 for a missionary journey through Vermont. He wrote from Governor Chittenden's farm in Williston that "I have rode more than 100 miles and seen no meeting house!" Writing in Abby Maria Hemenway's Vermont Historical Gazetteer, a West Fairlee historian described the situation in his town's frontier days: "For a long time the inhabitants were few, and generally poor, unable to build a house of worship, or support a pastor. . . . Hon. Nathaniel Niles for many years held religious meetings in his own house, and in other private dwellings and barns, as would best accommodate those who were interested in assembling for worship." 3 Such "cabin religion" was the common experience of most early Vermont settlers.4

Yankees who came to Vermont left their institutions behind them and built new ones slowly. By and large, these people were religious, though only a handful of them had formal places of worship.<sup>5</sup> And even if the

settlers wanted churches, most were glad to escape the restrictions of the established church in their former homes. Gradually, they found the common denominators, the kinds of articles of faith and covenants that would be the rocks upon which they would found their churches. Sometimes, however, these turned out to be split rocks. How religiously likeminded did Vermonters have to be to live together fraternally? And what evidence of religious affiliation did they show? Until well past 1791, only a very small percentage of the population were church members.

A number of historians have dealt with the topic of religion in early Vermont. Since 1980 there have been four especially substantial studies, each with a different focus. In his doctoral dissertation, "Legacy of Dissent: Religion and Politics in Revolutionary Vermont, 1749-1784," Donald A. Smith identified the variety of religious persuasions, declared that "prerevolutionary Vermont was a microcosm of the principal forces dividing New England society," and made a quantitative case that religious activism was the most important determinant in the Vermont rebellion against Britain and New York. 6 Donal Ward's doctoral dissertation, "Religious Enthusiasm in Vermont, 1761-1847," includes a brief discussion of the eighteenth-century revivalists. Randolph A. Roth, in his 1987 work The Democratic Dilemma, summarized Smith's thesis and considered religion as a social gyroscope. 8 More recently, in his 1993 book Revolutionary Outlaws, Michael A. Bellesiles treated Ethan Allen as a charismatic leader of a frontier society that was secular mainly because the sects canceled one another out.9 All four of these studies revise the traditional view, summarized in David M. Ludlum's Social Ferment in Vermont (1939). that the Vermont frontier was godless.10

Congregationalism was the established religion in all of colonial New England except Rhode Island. Congregational order assumed a community where magistrates and ministry cooperated to maintain religious standards; to destroy this unity destroyed religion. Nathan Perkins, an establishment minister, made a typically critical statement in the private diary of his Vermont missionary tour:

About 1 quarter of the inhabitants & almost all the men of learning [are] deists. . . . People pay little regard to the Sabbath; hunt & fish on that day frequently. Not more than % of the families attend family prayer. . . . About ½ would be glad to support public worship & the gospel ministry. The rest would choose to have no Sabbath – no ministers – no religion – no heaven – no hell – no morality. 11

Although Perkins divided the state into tidy fractions, he was only recording brief impressions based on visits to about two dozen households.

In his excellent description of eighteenth-century Vermont society,

Ludlum was not wrong; he merely told his story from the perspective of "the Puritan Counter-Reformation," as he called it. In missionary eyes, frontier people who did not go to church, who drank heavily, and who went unpunished for fishing, frolicking, extramarital sex, and all the other misbehaviors that blue laws had been condemning and curbing for years, were godless. Yet most woodspeople simply did not want the standing order, the version of Congregationalism established by the older New England states.

An example of such "godlessness" was George Avery of Royalton. One October day in 1780, Avery was husking corn "with other comerads" when "an old lady" went by "with solemn countenance agoing to meeting." Avery guessed it was Sunday because she "had on her Sabbath day mouth." The next day raiders burned the settlement and captured Avery. From a cabin his captors were about to burn he took a Bible and Isaac Watts's hymns, which he found "consoling to use when prisoners. . . . We used to read them and meditate in our journey." Avery was, in fact, religious, but like most frontier people, he put getting food for survival above losing good daylight by "agoing to meeting." From the "infidel" perspective, Avery and his "comerads" were like Yankee sailors, observing "no Sundays off soundings," and there were no tithing men and no justices of the peace to keep them from traveling on the Sabbath and make them attend church. Independent Vermont's courts and justice system paid attention to property law but not to religious delinquency.

## CHAPLAINS AND CAPTIVES

New France, in contrast, provided priests and chapel space at every outpost, where captains marched the troops to mass. Almost the only Europeans on the Vermont land until the 1760s, the French kept the British out of the north woods until the capture of Quebec in 1759. Their priests served and suffered with soldiers and habitants and reached out to the aborigines beyond the military frontier. A Sulpician ministered to the scurvy-ridden garrison throughout the first winter of 1665–1666 at Fort Ste. Anne on Isle La Motte. Father Emmanuel Crespel at Fort St. Frederick (Crown Point) in 1735–1736 told the common tale of scurvy, numbing cold, malaria, little game, and no one "with whom we could converse." Priests like Father Crespel represented Christianity in Vermont for nearly a century.

Protestantism first entered Vermont with the outbreak of Gray Lock's (or Lord Dummer's) War in 1723. Massachusetts built Fort Dummer (present-day Brattleboro) the next year. At least three Congregational chaplains served at the fort, but the other English outposts on the upper Connecticut River seem to have had none. 14 Chaplain Ebenezer Hinsdale

preached to the Indian traders who came to the truck house to sell pelts, skins, and moose tallow. An Indian woman who brought her baby for baptism could not understand why the chaplain would not do it unless he could baptize the mother, too.<sup>15</sup> The chasm between cultures was too great.

It is impossible here even to outline the complicated nature of Europeans' and Indians' attitudes about one another. Historians tend either to justify the European invasion or excoriate the invaders for the destruction of the first Americans. Faced with strange beings from out of their worlds, each side was wary, but each borrowed from the other things that glittered, that seemed to make life better. As a result each group was transformed, Europeans partially Indianized and Indians partially Europeanized.<sup>16</sup>

Let two examples from the captivity literature suggest the religion of the frontier when Indians had the upper hand. The stereotypical captivity narrative ratifies Samuel de Champlain's advice, "It would be better for [settlers] to die fighting, or kill themselves than fall into the hands of their enemies," but many captured New Englanders found that their captors treated them well. Take, for example, the experience of pious Nehemiah Howe, caught cutting wood outside the Great Meadow (Putney) stockade in October 1745. His captors, he wrote, "were generally kind to me while I was with 'em." One old warrior, "the best friend I had," took care of him, and another gave him a better pair of shoes. 18

Another captive's account is by Susannah Johnson of Number Four (Charlestown, New Hampshire), who feared and despised her Abenaki neighbors. In 1754 the Johnsons were captured and taken to Canada. On the way Susannah was seized with labor pains. Her captors made her a lean-to and waited while her husband and sister attended the delivery of Captive Johnson. These "savages" brought clothes for the baby and pins to fasten them. They made porridge and johnnycake and brought a cup to steep roots in for tea and a wooden spoon to feed the baby with, and they let Susannah rest for a whole day, making a stretcher for the other prisoners to carry her on. 19 Compare this special care with a report of the apparently normal treatment of Indian childbirth on the trail: on Sunday, May 3, 1730, near Springfield on the Black River, "an old pregnant squaw that traveled with us stopped alone and was delivered of a child, and by Monday noon overtook us with a living child on her back." 20

During the American Revolution, chaplains accompanied New Englanders invading Canada or served at forts and bivouacs in the Champlain Valley, an important theater. Young college graduates, often in their

first southern New England parishes, caught the war fever and hastened into service to pray with the dying, write letters to families, and revive morale by raising the divine standard among the men. From the capture of Ticonderoga (unblessed by any chaplain but taken "in the name of the great Jehovah," according to Ethan Allen's account) to the surrender of Burgoyne's army at Saratoga, there were never enough chaplains in the Champlain Valley. For those three seasons, 1775–1777, considerably fewer than one chaplain ministered to each 1,000 troops. Their limited presence could not prevent cowardice, desertion, profanity, drunkenness, camp followers, Sabbath-breaking, or unceremonious mass burials of privates. But despite overwhelming duties and severe risks, they continued to serve for love of country and their fellow soldiers. They had no military rank, and the pay—\$20 a month in 1776 and only \$33 the next year—was usually in arrears and in depreciated paper money.<sup>21</sup>

Congregationalist David Avery, one of the most famous revolutionary chaplains, served at the Battle of Bunker Hill, helped build fortifications at Ticonderoga, and distinguished himself by exposure to German fire at the Battle of Bennington. A carpenter's apprentice called to the ministry, Avery had read theology and tutored at Eleazar Wheelock's Indian Charity School at Lebanon, Connecticut. After study at Yale, he served two stints teaching the Oneida in central New York. When the news of Lexington reached his Gageborough (now Windsor) parish in the Berkshires, he told his congregation he was going to join the army (without the usual church council to authorize his absence until two years later); recruited a company who chose him captain; joined a regiment in Cambridge on April 29, 1775; and the next day preached a red-hot sermon to the entire army in the open air. "His fame is Great throughout the Camp," wrote Chaplain Ebenezer David after he had met "that good Soldier" Avery at Lake George. "A worthy man. . . . I long for an interview with him."

Congregationalist Ammi Ruhammah Robbins also admired the rugged Avery, who could breeze by the stinking hospital beds and afterwards eat like a logger. "I want a constitution of brass to tarry here," wrote Robbins, who was "utterly unable to go through the hospital."<sup>23</sup> Ebenezer David appreciated the few who responded to his chaplaincy: "Notwithstanding their great distress found them in general as stupid as the beasts that pearish—yet . . . some . . . appeared not past fealing. One Evening a number I had almost said of Skellitons after prayer [came up for questions and exhortation]. . . . One say, 'Oh how I doe love to hear Minister talk.' This was a boy. I have ever found the Chaplains visits taken well by the sick."<sup>24</sup>

# THE QUEST FOR CHURCHES

As relative peace came to the Hampshire Grants, more settlers came to the self-proclaimed republic, where they tried to recreate the society they had left behind, including town churches. Avery, drawn back to the Grants like other former soldiers, served as Bennington's second pastor from 1780 to 1783. But his years of military chaplaincy had lessened the former artisan's penchant for leveling. He had been a junior in 1768 when Yale abolished "placing" (the ranking of students by their father's social status); Avery had then rejoiced that "the finest coat and largest ruffles" would no longer be marks of distinction, compared to scholarship and speaking. <sup>25</sup> But his imperious manner as a pastor demanded a deference his congregation would be damned if they would give—and they were indeed damned by Avery for not giving it.

Bennington, one of the prime parishes in Vermont, had been without a pastor for many months when it called Avery in 1780. Perhaps dazzled by the chance to have a war hero, Bennington churchgoers discounted reports of his conservative, "Hopkintonian" theology, which much of the parish rejected. When the congregation wearied of wrangling with him and dismissed Avery three years later, they waited another three years before calling his successor.

The historian John M. Comstock in 1914 asserted that nearly all the Congregational churches organized before 1777 were in the Connecticut Valley. Scholars since have used Comstock's observation as strong evidence to contrast the soberly conservative east side from the radical west side of Vermont. However, those differences were most apparent between hilltowns and valley villages in the same counties on both sides of the Green Mountains. In the eastern part of Vermont, settlers continued to come from southern New England, aware of the war and of New York's legal but unenforced title. Towns like Brattleboro, Newbury, and Townshend hedged by paying charter fees to both New Hampshire and New York. Even those eastern towns with only New Hampshire titles had the comfort of distance and the mountain barrier between them and the Yorkers.

The gathering of Congregational churches in the western counties was subject to greater obstacles. It took a risk-taking investor to buy a shaky New Hampshire title to land right next to New York. Furthermore, fear of raids rolled back settlement north of a Castleton-Pittsford line until 1780.

Congregationalism was the established religion in Massachusetts and Connecticut, though dissenting sects were gathering strength even before the Revolution. Many dissenters came to Vermont in the 1770s and 1780s. Shaftsbury Baptists called an elder (their title for pastor) in 1780. In the

west from Pownal to Rutland the "revolutionary stir" produced flocks of Baptists in Pownal, Shaftsbury, Wallingford, and Clarendon.<sup>29</sup>

Scotch-Irish Presbyterians from New Hampshire usually joined with their fellow Calvinists, the Congregationalists. But Ryegate and Barnet stuck to Presbyterianism. Ryegate was established when the Scots American Company of Farmers bought a 10,000-acre block of land in 1773 and came to dominate the town, although constituting only half the population. Their agents, having searched the eastern seaboard as far south as North Carolina for over four months, chose Ryegate because of its good farmland, cheap price (sixteen pence an acre), and water privileges and because "we are within six miles of a good Presbyterian meeting." Furthermore, Newbury was "very strict about keeping the Sabbath." 30

In Barnet, the next town to the north, established by the United Company of Farmers for the Shires of Perth and Stirling, was a smaller, later imitation of the Ryegate company. Both depended on visiting ministers who traveled some distance: President John Witherspoon from Princeton; Thomas Clark from Salem, New York; others from Londonderry, New Hampshire; or the nearby parson at Newbury. Barnet first installed David Goodwillie, an Associate Presbyterian, early in 1791, but Ryegate had to wait another eight years. Goodwillie sometimes preached in Ryegate, too. It was "a poor man's country in which some grew rich," notably James Whitelaw of Ryegate and Alexander Harvey of Barnet, original agents and leading citizens.<sup>31</sup>

Mother Ann Lee, founder of the Shakers and probably the single most important itinerant in the early 1780s, won a "sizable number of adherents" in mission groups at Guilford, Lyndon, and Pittsford. These were few in comparison with some 5,000 Shakers gathered in families at Shirley, Harvard, Tyringham, and Hancock, Massachusetts, and Enfield, New Hampshire. Some Vermont converts joined Shaker families elsewhere.<sup>32</sup>

Anglicans worshiped with only lay leadership until Reuben Garlick of Alburg and Bethuel Chittenden (the governor's brother) of Tinmouth were ordained Episcopal deacons in 1787. Access from New York attracted Anglicans to Arlington and Quakers from Dutchess County, New York, to Danby. Quakers also seeped into western Vermont from coastal New England, probably to strengthen the existing nuclei from New York. Huldah and Joseph Hoag had been recorded in the Nine Partners Monthly Meeting, Dutchess County, before they moved to Starksboro about 1790.<sup>33</sup>

It is odd that although Methodism was a leading religion on the American frontier, few Methodists came to Vermont until nearly the end of the eighteenth century. "Mother" Margaret Peckett, who had been house-keeper for John Wesley, and her husband, Giles, opened their Bradford log cabin in 1780 "for religious services for any Christians, ministers,

or people, that love the Savior, irregardless of their denomination." The Pecketts served their neighborhood much as many other pious leaders did in their towns. Yet only two Methodist itinerants reached Vermont before 1791: Samuel Wigton, assigned to the Champlain Valley in 1788, and Jesse Lee in Windham County in 1790.<sup>34</sup>

Dutch Reformed churches dotted the Hudson Valley but sent no colonists to Vermont. A group of Dutch farmers who settled early under New York's Hoosac Patent in Pownal were driven off by the Green Mountain Boys. 35 The few individuals with Dutch names (Van Buren, Vanderlip, Hendricks, Westinghousen) in the first two Vermont population censuses in western Bennington County did not make the critical mass to form a church with the required Amsterdam-trained dominie.

#### THE WEAKENING OF THE MULTIPLE ESTABLISHMENT

In "Legacy of Dissent" Smith analyzed the character of Vermont immigrants from 1749 to 1784 to show a "dual heritage" of Arminian Old Lights versus Calvinist New Lights. Old Lights were gradualist, rationalist upholders of the traditional, organic community and the Half-Way Covenant. They assumed that children should have membership for most purposes as a birthright, because if they were brought up in Christian members' families, they would turn out Christian. For them, "Christian liberty" was obedience to minister and magistrate. New Lights, products of revivalism, assumed that the first step toward salvation was the realization that we can do nothing by our own efforts to escape our thoroughly sinful situation. This they called "conviction of sin." Then came personal experience of God's grace, transformation by the Holy Spirit, and joining a church of saints gathered from the world. New Lights discounted the trained ministry and wanted no cultural distance between elder and congregation. They wanted clergy to earn some of their livelihood themselves, usually by farming, and receive the rest by parishioners' subscriptions. In some situations they accepted town taxes for religious purposes.

Arminians, named after a Dutch theologian, rejected the Calvinist doctrine that God predestined only a few for salvation. Deists, Episcopalians, and some Baptists and Friends were various shades of Arminian or Universalist. In the 1790s the Free Will Baptists, Universalists, and Methodists strengthened the majority with this belief in Vermont. Although the newcomers wanted to escape the old conflicts, they brought most of them along, and the situation "magnified the legacy of dissent." <sup>36</sup>

Each year brought new settlers, shifting the balance between cliques or adding new groups from different towns with different religious habits and customs. This made the achievement of community a will-o'-thewisp ever fading as towns aimed and moved toward it. By 1780 Vermont's

religious question was whether to have a standing order of established churches as did Massachusetts, Connecticut, and New Hampshire or a popular government with separation of church and state. The eventual solution was the multiple establishment: towns collected taxes to build a meetinghouse or pay the minister's salary and required each citizen to provide support to the majority religion unless an officer of a nearby dissenting church certified that the citizen supported that church. Smith has called this solution a "reformed Christian republican policy"; the General Assembly had enacted the multiple establishment and the blue laws, but the towns decided whether and how strictly to enforce them.<sup>37</sup>

In the 1780s thirty-two more Congregational churches had been organized, nineteen on the west side, with a majority of some forty ministers settled in Vermont churches arriving in the eleven years from 1780 through 1790. In the same period traveling elders formed some thirty Baptist churches, half from Pownal to Brandon and half from Guilford to Woodstock. Examination of a good many records of churches established in this period leads to the informal conclusion that few of any denomination had over twenty members each at the start. Even as late as 1805, the first religious society in Burlington organized with only fourteen members.<sup>38</sup>

All Christians in the Puritan tradition—and that included all Vermonters except the few Episcopalians tarred with the Tory brush—had common practices governing baptism, joining a church, worship, "Christian walking" (living a Christian life), and dying in the care of the community. Even the few Episcopalians carried a good deal of Puritanism with them when they left their Congregational churches. Others, of course, were royal officers and other Anglicans who came directly from England. Almost all Vermonters were in this Puritan tradition, but they were not practicing much of it.

Those practicing it the least were the many deists among both the leadership and the ordinary settlers. In 1784 Ethan Allen churned out 477 pages of verbose argument against superstition, miracles, and anything that violated natural law. Like the rest of his generation, Allen was saturated with the Bible, as his quick response to his Yorker enemies threatening him with war attests: "The gods of the hills are not the gods of the valleys" (I Kings 20:28). Reason, the Only Oracle of Man was notorious, judging by the horror-stricken reactions of the author's opponents. Perhaps 1,000 copies of the original, abridgments, and facsimiles have circulated over the past two centuries. But the people who agreed with his beliefs in the rationalism of common sense, immortality, morality, and progress probably did not read it. More likely, someone in a tavern

bar threw out a phrase such as "God is infinitely good . . . [therefore] there cannot be an infinite evil in the universe," 39 and those present spent the evening debating the proposition. Like Robert Ingersoll a century later, Allen delighted in pointing out "the mistakes of Moses" and in scoffing at superstition. A folk belief in mental telepathy ("I had a presentiment he would die at the very time he died") and a largely unexamined faith in providence as ordaining all things regardless of nature were there to scoff at. 40

## CHRISTIAN PRACTICE

Baptism was a ritual symbolizing the experience of initiation into the "mystical body of Christ" (the Quakers called it "convincement"). If you were Old Light like Charles Chauncy of Boston's First Church, you baptized as soon as the infant could stand the sprinkling. The ceremony aimed to pledge the parents to bring up the child into a religious life, as god-parents pledged in other denominations, allowing a confirmation of the baptismal promise after the member reached responsible age. The New Lights, or Separate Congregationalists, and the Baptists (as well as the new sects sprung from the Baptists or Separates) felt that joining should be the conscious act of an adult. They delayed baptism until a person could report a life-changing experience of grace. Very few of the settlers were baptized church members in the towns that had churches.

I have found only one mention of the regular practice in settled places of bringing a letter from one's home church to the new abode: Aaron Hutchinson's church consisted of those persons in Hartford, Pomfret, and Woodstock "who brought their church membership with them." <sup>41</sup> Perhaps transfer certificates were so normal that they did not need mentioning.

In such an important event as founding a church, settlers became members by subscribing to articles of faith and a covenant. A missionary such as Nathan Perkins helped settlers get started by drafting a theological statement and list of members' duties, or a deacon brought from his old church the articles and covenant. Articles of faith showed remarkable uniformity, but the implications of each article allowed for what insiders have thought of as earnest searching for the truth and outsiders have called endless bickering. The organization of a visible "church of the baptized brethren," as the Royalton Baptists called themselves, included sisters equally. The more churches emphasized the conversion experience, the less they depended on certificates. In some churches candidates for membership would be expected to relate their experience of Christian conversion. Sometimes they would be "propounded" after they had told the

pastor they were ready to join; that is, they would be announced as a candidate, so that the existing members could have time to consider the applicant's "conversation and Christian walking."

Members' most important duties were household worship, Bible study, attending public worship, and "watch and ward"-helping each other live as if heaven were their destination. At its best, watch and ward meant caring for fellow members; at its worst, it meant malicious gossip and charging personal enemies with sinful conduct. Every member was responsible for admonishing neighbors for profanity, frolicking, intemperance, and family violence. The injunction in Matthew 18:15-17 was to admonish a sinning brother privately; if he would not listen, the complaint was repeated before one or two witnesses; if that failed, it was brought before the whole congregation. The resulting church trials, the soap operas of those days, required confession by the guilty or excommunication of the intransigent. Expulsion of an unrepentant member – the Bible said he was to be treated like a pagan or a tax-gatherer-set a powerful example when the whole town participated in the activities of only one church, but in the woods the privileges of membership were few, the Baptists were never far away, and it was easy to avoid church taxes. Disowning, as the Quakers called it, became the advertisement of a fact, not a punishment.

Indeed, the Vermont frontier was not the brawling place one might expect to find in a state of nature. The settlers were uneasy in their wilderness anarchy more because of the uncertainties of poverty than the dangers from theft and violence. Nature, not humanity, probably committed most of the violence. Falling trees were more deadly than guns in the Vermont woods. (In spite of the folklore about the deadly frontier rifle, eighteenth-century smooth bores were in short supply and rifles almost nonexistent.) The settlers were better at fraud than force: smuggling, counterfeiting, and horse stealing were the most prevalent crimes. 42

The frontier paradox of high alcohol consumption and little violence is epitomized in Ethan Allen, whose toping and violent Old Testament invective was not followed up with mayhem and murder. From the preacher to the pauper, people in this early period consumed more alcohol per capita than at any time after. Stills were numerous, taverns existed every few miles along the highway, and applejack was in every cellar. In this context, can we not assume much violence in the household, if not against strangers like the Reverend Perkins? He noted as he passed through that infidel town of Burlington, "Col. Stephen Keyes whipped bruised & nearly killed a Dr. Stephens last month because he brought in a high bill for attending his father-in-law, Col. Sheldon." Keyes kept a tavern on the

Burlington waterfront and had a short fuse, perhaps from excessive use of his own liquor. A few pages earlier, Perkins opened the curtain on the famine year of 1789 with the dictum, "Woods make people love one another & kind & obliging & good-natured."

Church discipline called for maintaining the family altar (worship in the household before and after work) and regular Bible reading and study. Believers assumed that God's Word, revealed in Holy Scripture, is inerrant and subject to only one interpretation. An astonishingly high literacy rate, 45 intense curiosity about the terms of salvation, and freedom to pore over the sacred texts resulted in marvelous diversity of belief, multiplying disagreements.

Most of the time people did not object to worshiping with Christians they disagreed with. They were willing to sign a church's articles of faith and pass time arguing with an infidel deist or Quaker. Nonmembers attended services furnished by passing preachers or the town minister when it was convenient. If the minister preached in a nearby cabin or barn, if the streams were fordable or the drifts not too deep, if the work was in hand and nobody was sick, and if they felt like it, they came. For fellowship, settlers had the choice of a taproom in a public house or going to meeting. How many attended is guesswork. Perhaps 200 could have crammed themselves into Daniel Foot's 40-by-75-foot barn at Middlebury Falls.

Death punctuated with a ritualized period of mourning the loss of a member, translation to the glory of eternal life, and promise of the resurrection of the saints (sinners forgiven by the saving grace of God). Frontier families knew the importance of sitting up with the dying and comforting the family; they deemed it significant to catch the last words spoken at the awesome meeting with the Creator. Funerals were not so much to eulogize as they were an opportunity for believers to rededicate themselves.

#### THE MINISTERS

Few were called to minister, teach, or oversee the discipline of the church. Gospel order was, as the Cambridge Platform of 1648 put it, a mixed government under Christ the King, with officers ruling as an aristocracy but democratically elected and removed by the members of the church. Recognition of a person's gifts in the ministry was called ordination, and ordination sermons outlined the duties of these religious leaders. Each congregation might have several recognized exhorters, evangelists, teachers, and deacons but only one pastor (unless he was infirm and needed an assistant). In the earliest days it was likely for one pastor to serve two or more towns.

The Quakers called ordination "recording." The Quaker understand-

ing of the priesthood of all believers went a step beyond that of other Protestants: anyone gathered for worship in silent waiting for the blessing of the Holy Spirit was free to speak in ministry. When Friends of either sex ministered acceptably, consistently, and over many years, however, the meeting recorded their gifts. Recording shared one aspect of ordination without assigning official functions to the recorded minister except travel in the ministry and attendance at the meeting of ministers and elders.

A church "called" a minister to the parish after listening to all the candidates and negotiating a covenant or contract with the one members chose. If he accepted the call, the church "settled" him for life by covenant between pastor and parish. If he was the first settled minister in town, he was entitled to a lot, usually the worst land in town, which he might swap for fewer acres that he could farm or sell. The covenant recorded the religious expectations and mundane agreements in bushels of wheat, cords of firewood, annual increases, and other stipulations. Like marriage, the bond was expected to last (the parish felt defrauded by those who sold too soon after arrival), but Vermonters also expected trouble and allowed divorce from the parish as from a spouse. Among Presbyterians and Congregationalists, a trained clergy still expected deference from their flocks. Where they achieved it, they had long tenure and were often called "father." 46

These men were officers, not professionals. Members were "professors" who professed their faith. Charisma maintained revivalist leadership, and since this gift is unpredictable, the missionaries had trouble maintaining unity until they evolved a discipline in the 1790s and after. But the prestige of clergy trended downward. The scarcity of candidates in wartime put the pious more upon their own resources during the long periods between "supplying" or temporary preachers, and members gained confidence from their experience in ruling themselves. Even settled pastors had their images damaged as the result of scandals of one kind or another.

Some towns had superannuated ministers who could not keep a prosperous church in a prosperous town but under the guise of mission lived out their days on a frontier that paid them little heed and less victuals. Other towns found recent college graduates who could not get a call to a parish in settled country. Although they had proved their ambition by persevering through college, all but two or three Harvard or Yale men were near the bottom of their class socially. They plied their trade as itinerants between towns that hired preaching. Nathan Perkins ran into a Yale acquaintance who had tried for eighteen years to get a job as a settled preacher in ninety places and was still itinerant. <sup>47</sup> John E. Goodrich wrote that whether they were hired for short terms or called and

settled, in either case "there was an unusual proportion of unworthy men among the Vermont clergy" before 1791.<sup>48</sup> But Goodrich judged in comparison to later clergy. These pioneer preachers were the best available and did their best, scraping out a living any way they could.

They had more competition than they would have had back home, because in trying to collect the land reserved for the first settled minister, churches sometimes set up a call to "beat the Baptists" or "beat the Congos" and get the land. When two Congregationalists in Sunderland took their case to court, the judge decided in favor of the man who was ordained a few minutes earlier, according to one story. 49 Shaftsbury Baptists declined the endowment and, as in some other towns, designated the rent to be used for schools. Some towns divided the rent in proportion to the number of members in each denomination. In towns chartered by New Hampshire, the glebe land was reserved for the Anglican Society for the Propagation of the Gospel in Foreign Parts, but the General Assembly tried to divert its income for schools. After a generation of litigation, the courts decided in favor of the Episcopalians. Although the Quakers were the first majority in Danby, they would not accept the minister's right, and it went to the Baptists, organized in 1781.50

Except for the uncommon congregations with ministers "married" to them for long terms, like Asa Burton's Thetford flock (1779–1836) or David Goodwillie's Associate Presbyterians in Barnet (1790–1830), most early Vermont churches had several extended periods without a settled pastor. Only ten ministers had served Vermont Congregational churches before 1775.<sup>51</sup>

The end of hostilities with Britain brought more preachers to Vermont. David Avery was one of twenty-one Congregational pastors settled over Vermont parishes by the end of 1780. One wonders what promoter of missions told Ezra Stiles in 1780 that Vermont had sixty churches without pastors; <sup>52</sup> in fact, only four (Halifax, Hartland, Royalton, and Windsor west parish) lacked settled ministers that year.

All but three of the Congregational clergy settled in Vermont before 1791 were college graduates. Of these three, Jedediah Dewey of Bennington had experience as a pastor in Massachusetts, and Lemuel Haynes had read divinity with Daniel Farrand in Connecticut. Yale supplied sixteen, Harvard twelve, and Dartmouth ten graduates to Vermont Congregational churches before 1791. Yale and Dartmouth men were mainly in the Connecticut Valley. Gradually, from the 1760s to 1791, fewer Harvard men and more from Yale won posts in the new settlements. This meant that the few who wanted organized religion preferred young men from Yale who read with such Yale-trained theologians as Joseph Bellamy, Samuel Hopkins, and Nathaniel Emmons. More liberal Harvard was failing to

.....

prepare preachers fit for frontier parishes. Daniel Clarke Sanders (Harvard class of 1788), who served more than twenty years in Vergennes and Burlington (1794–1815), was glad to get back to a congregation in Medfield, Massachusetts, in the neighborhood of Harvard. He wrote to a friend that wild horses could not drag him back to Burlington.<sup>53</sup>

In a good many towns, difficulties collecting church rates led to voluntary subscription for part or all of the costs of keeping a pastor. Proposals to hire town preaching were often defeated because too many declined to pay for it. When they did vote the church tax and found a preacher, they accepted what was available, whatever his religious persuasion.

#### THE PERSISTENCE OF VOLUNTARISM

When Vermont negotiated admission to the United States in 1789–1791, it ended the independent republic, along with its failures in dealing with the British in Canada and with the United States. Admission confirmed victory over the Allen faction; over the British, who were hoping for a dependent buffer state; and over New York claims in Congress. The political tension between the southern-oriented Connecticut Valley and the northern-oriented Champlain Valley continued, with southwestern Vermont (from Rutland and Castleton to Bennington), oriented toward Albany, exercising its balance of power. Vermont still had a mainly subsistence economy, but the commercial tail wagged the subsistence dog: settlers aimed to barter their surpluses of skins, ashes, timber, cattle, and wheat, if not at the ports, then in the neighborhood.

As producers of goods had started to compete in the markets, so did wandering preachers peddling their brand of the gospel to people free to choose. The multiple establishment continued, favoring the Congregational churches, but it was less and less enforced. Although people still congregated in cabins, a few barnlike meetinghouses without belfries or towers, like the one built in Rockingham in 1787, were raised on town taxes and the subscriptions of the zealous. Since the revolutionary stir in the southwest, the mobile population was more open to revivalist religion. Timothy Rogers, the Ferrisburgh Quaker entrepreneur, found people along his way ready to discuss the fine points of theology and morals; the first "raving arminian methodist," as Nathan Perkins called Rogers, had appeared in Sunderland by 1789 to compete for souls with the Calvinists. 54

Wilderness taught people to do it themselves and not to depend on laws to dictate their religion. Even in tightly settled England, the Puritan ancestors of these "foresters," as Timothy Dwight referred to them, had taught that the Bible is literally the Word of God, and one can read all about God's good news in the Good Book oneself. Most Vermonters wanted

no bishop of an established church, no Saybrook or Savoy Platform devised by Congregationalists or Baptists on the model of the Westminster Confession to maintain social order.

Neither did most of them care to be served by second-rate itinerants, though frontier scarcity taught them that if they did want to hire preaching, or to raise a meetinghouse, they should welcome the help of those who might differ on the fine points of doctrine. A generation later, when there were enough of various birds of a feather for several flocks, much of the tolerant but combative laissez-faire of the frontier evaporated. But the voluntarism, born of the frontier, persisted.

#### NOTES

<sup>1</sup> Charles H. Hubbard and Justus Dartt, *History of the Town of Springfield, Vermont . . . 1752–1895* (Boston: G. M. Walker, 1895), 72.

<sup>2</sup> Nathan Perkins, A Narrative of a Tour Through the State of Vermont from April 27 to June 12, 1789, ed. Charles V. S. Borst (Rutland, Vt.: Tuttle, 1964), 27. A good, short account of Perkins's trip is in Michael A. Bellesiles, Revolutionary Outlaws: Ethan Allen and the Struggle for Independence on the Early American Frontier (Charlottesville: University Press of Virginia, 1993), 218-219, 229, 231, 233, 257.

<sup>3</sup> Alvah Bean in A. M. Hemenway, ed., *Vermont Historical Gazetteer*, vol. 2 (Burlington: A. M. Hemenway, 1871), 915, 1170.

<sup>4</sup> Although one would expect that a devout and literate settler would find a religious outlet in keeping a diary where churchgoing was impractical, I have found no such journals for Vermont before Perkins's.

<sup>5</sup> My assumption is that humanity is religious and that religious history is all of history with special attention to the ways in which people deal with the sacred, just as political history is all of history with special attention to the distribution and exercise of power, and so on through all the categories of life.

<sup>6</sup> Clark University, 1980; copy in Vermont Historical Society library.

7 University of Notre Dame, 1980; copy in Special Collections, Bailey/Howe Library, University of Vermont.

<sup>8</sup> Randolph A. Roth, The Democratic Dilemma: Religion, Reform, and the Social Order in the Connecticut River Valley of Vermont, 1791–1850 (New York: Cambridge University Press, 1987), 26–39.

9 Bellesiles also devotes a great deal of attention to the religious milieu of northwestern Connecticut, where Ethan Allen grew up. His summary of the religious situation in Vermont after the Revolution is in *Revolutionary Outlaws*, 217-222. Also of note, by way of comparison, Douglas Hardy Sweet, "Church and Community: Town Life and Ministerial Ideals in Revolutionary New Hampshire" (Ph.D. diss., Columbia University, 1978), concludes that the inflexibility of Congregationalism prevented it from meeting the challenges of the New Hampshire frontier. The growth of dissenting groups broke down the unity of the town as a government and as a Congregational church.

10 David M. Ludlum, Social Ferment in Vermont (New York: Columbia University Press, 1939),

especially 19-28.

11 Quoted in T. D. Seymour Bassett, comp., Outsiders Inside Vermont: Three Centuries of Visitors' Viewpoints on the Green Mountain State, 2d ed. (1967; reprint, Canaan, N.H.: Phoenix Publishing, 1976), 45. Ludlum, Social Ferment, 19–28, uses the same statement as the clinching evidence in his pile of testimony about frontier infidelity. It is the most-quoted passage in Perkins's often-quoted Narrative.

<sup>12</sup> Reminiscence of about 1846 in Evelyn Mary Wood Lovejoy, *History of Royalton, Vermont* (Royalton: Town of Royalton and the Republican Woman's Club, 1911), 151, 153. His full story suggests that Avery "got religion" later. The Royalton Congregational church, organized in 1777, had no house of worship until 1791.

<sup>13</sup> See Emmanuel Crespel, *Travels in North America* (London: S. Low, 1797), 40-46. François Dollier de Casson's account of his service on Isle La Motte, in his *Histoire de Montréal*, is translated

and abridged in Bassett, Outsiders Inside Vermont, 8-12.

<sup>14</sup> They were Daniel Dwight (ca. 1724–1727), at a salary of £100 a year, larger than that of his brother Timothy, who commanded the fort; Ebenezer Hinsdale (ca. 1731–1742), and Andrew Gardner, Sr. (1748). <sup>15</sup> See Mary R. Cabot, *Annals of Brattleboro*, 1681–1895 (Brattleboro, Vt.: E. L. Hildreth, 1921), 10. 12. 16–17.

<sup>16</sup> For the religion of the Western Abenaki, the first chapter in any history of religion in Vermont, see William A. Haviland and Marjory W. Power, *The Original Vermonters: Native Inhabitants, Past and Present* (Hanover, N.H.: University Press of New England, 1981). See especially the writings of Gordon M. Day listed in its bibliography.

<sup>17</sup> Quoted and translated from his *Voyages* (1632) in Bassett, *Outsiders Inside Vermont*, 6–7. Zadock Steele, *The Indian Captive*. . . . (Montpelier, Vt.: E. P. Walton, 1818 and several subsequent editions),

is a good example of the stereotype.

<sup>18</sup> [Nehemiah Howe], A Narrative of the Captivity of Nehemiah How (Boston: Printed and sold opposite to the Prison in Queen Street, 1748), 3-9.

19 [Susannah Willard Johnson Hastings], A Narrative of the Captivity of Mrs. Johnson. . . . (1796;

3d ed., Windsor, Vt.: Thomas M. Pomroy, 1814), 8-9, 32-33.

<sup>20</sup> Diary of a Fort Dummer scout in Cabot, *Annals of Brattleboro*, 14. Jemima Sartwell Phipps Howe Tute (1723–1805), a fascinating frontierswoman thrice widowed, is made to use Indian stereotyping in "A Particular Account of the Captivity of Mrs. Jemima Howe, by the Rev. Bunker Gay, of Hinsdale, in a Letter to the Author," in Jeremy Belknap, *History of New Hampshire*, vol. 3 (Dover, N.H.: John Farmer, 1812), 177–190.

<sup>21</sup> John W. Krueger summarized the chaplaincy in "Troop Life at the Champlain Valley Forts During the American Revolution," Fort Ticonderoga Museum Bulletin 14 (September 1982): 165-177. See also Joel Tyler Headley, The Chaplains and Clergy of the Revolution (New York: Scribner's, 1864), 89-106 (on Samuel Spring, who served at Mount Independence) and 128 (on Thomas Allen of Pittsfield, who accompanied the Berkshire militia to the Battle of Bennington).

<sup>22</sup> Jeannette D. Black and William G. Roelker, eds., A Rhode Island Chaplain in the Revolution (Port Washington, N.Y.: Kennikat Press, 1949), 27; Frederick Chase, A History of Dartmouth College and the Town of Hanover, New Hampshire, ed. John K. Lord (Cambridge: John Wilson and Son, 1891), 308-309; sketches of Avery in Headley, Chaplains and Clergy, 287-299; Franklin B. Dexter, Biographical Sketches of the Graduates of Yale College, vol. 2 (New York: Holt, 1903), 305-308; and in William B. Sprague, Annals of the American Pulpit, vol. 1, The Congregationalists (New York: P. Carter, 1857), 697 n. The story that he was converted by George Whitefield is apparently apocryphal, although he was certainly an evangelical or New Light.

<sup>23</sup> Journal of the Rev. Ammi R. Robbins (New Haven, Conn.: B. L. Hamlen, 1850), especially

25-26, 30, 33, 36-37.

<sup>24</sup> Letter from Mount Independence to Nicholas Brown, Providence, Rhode Island, 31 August 1776, in Black and Roelker, *A Rhode Island Chaplain*, 27. David (Brown class of 1772), an ordained Seven-Day Baptist minister, had been principal of Providence Latin School before the Revolution. He died in service.

<sup>25</sup> Quoted in Brooks Mather Kelley, Yale: A History (New Haven, Conn.: Yale University Press,

1974), 78.

<sup>26</sup> Or "Edwardsian," the theology of Jonathan Edwards developed by Samuel Hopkins between the Great Awakening of 1734–1749 and the American Revolution. See Joseph A. Conforti, Samuel Hopkins and the New Divinity Movement: Calvinism, the Congregational Ministry, and Reform in New England Between the Great Awakenings (Grand Rapids: William B. Eerdmans, 1981). New Lights and Hopkintonians supported the revivalism of the awakenings; Old Lights opposed it.

<sup>27</sup> See David Avery, Narrative of the Rise and Progress of the Difficulties Which Have Issued in the Separation Between the Minister and People of Bennington, 1783; with a Valedictory Address (Bennington, Vt.: Haswell and Russell, 1783); Bellesiles, Revolutionary Outlaws, 234–237. The "Revd Mr. Avery of Stamford, on mission to Vermont," who was "deeply mortified at ye Superior defference showed to" Nathan Perkins at the meeting of the ministerial association in Poultney, June 1789, may have been the former Bennington pastor (Perkins, Narrative, 55).

<sup>28</sup> John M. Comstock, *Congregational Churches* (St. Johnsbury, Vt.: Caledonian, 1914), 8. His second edition (1942), 9, showed the same preponderance continuing until the end of the fighting

in the northern theater.

<sup>29</sup> Stephen A. Marini, Radical Sects of Revolutionary New England (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1982), 40-48, discusses the wave of revivalism that sent New Light groups through northern New England and Nova Scotia. They won over many—probably a majority—who were dissatisfied with orthodox Congregationalism.

<sup>30</sup> Bernard Bailyn has a superb description of the founding of Ryegate in *Voyagers to the West* (New York: Knopf, 1986), 604–637, quotations on 619, 637.

<sup>31</sup> "Ecclesiastical History" of Barnet by Thomas Goodwillie, son of the first settled minister, in Hemenway, *Vermont Historical Gazetteer*, 1: 284–302.

<sup>32</sup> Marini, Radical Sects, 94, 133; Hamilton V. Bail, "Zadock Wright, That 'Devilish' Tory of Hartland," Vermont History 26 (Fall 1968): 186-203.

<sup>33</sup> Journal of the Life of Joseph Hoag (Auburn, N.Y., 1861; reprint, London: A. W. Bennett, 1862), 52 69

<sup>34</sup> Silas McKeen, A History of Bradford, Vermont (Montpelier, Vt.: J. D. Clark, 1875), quoted in Charles Downer Schwarz and Ouida Davis Schwarz, A Flame of Fire: The Story of the Troy Annual Conference (Rutland, Vt.: Academy Books, 1982), 44; see also 67, 118; James Mudge, History of the New England Conference of the Methodist Episcopal Church, 1796-1910 (Boston: New England Conference of the Methodist Episcopal Church, 1910), 33.

<sup>35</sup> [Jehiel Johns], Huntington, to G. W. Benedict, Burlington, 19 May 1840, reminiscing about the Revolution, in Stevens Family Papers, 9-18, in Special Collections, Bailey/Howe Library, Uni-

versity of Vermont. Attribution by J. Kevin Graffagnino.

Smith, "Legacy of Dissent," 868-872.
 William G. McLoughlin discussed the principal contests between Baptists and Congregationalists in "Disestablishment in Vermont, 1768-1807," in his New England Dissent, 1630-1833, vol. 2 (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1971), 789-812.

<sup>38</sup>Burlington, Vt., First Congregational Church, The Hundredth Anniversary of the Founding of

the First Church, Burlington, Vt. (Burlington: First Congregational Church, 1905), [9].

<sup>39</sup> Ethan Allen, Reason, the Only Oracle of Man (Bennington, Vt.: Anthony Haswell, 1784), 110.
<sup>40</sup> See Bellesiles, Revolutionary Outlaws, 217-244, and T.D.S. Bassett, "Ira Allen and the Headless Woman," Burlington Free Press, 30 October 1977; "Mixed Reviews for Ethan Allen's Stodgy Bible," Burlington Free Press, 6 November 1977; and "Ethan Allen's Religious Philosophy," Burlington Free Press, 13 November 1977. The journal of the Quaker Timothy Rogers of Ferrisburgh and later Yonge Street, Ontario (typescript and original in the archives of Canadian Yearly Meeting of Friends, Pickering College, Newmarket, Ontario), mentions in his disputes with deists several cases where "the spirit" told someone of imminent death. Ethan Allen was not the only "frontier philosopher" devoting hours of old age to a theological dissertation: former congressman Nathaniel Niles a generation later left over 200 pages of musings, now in the Vermont Historical Society, MSS 23 #92.

<sup>41</sup> Henry S. Dana, *History of Woodstock, Vermont* (Boston: Houghton Mifflin, 1889), 424.
<sup>42</sup> Although she is wrong about racial antagonism, especially in the Missisquoi Valley, and does not deal with violence of whites against whites, Dorothy Canfield Fisher, *Vermont Tradition: The Biography of an Outlook on Life* (Boston: Little, Brown, 1953), 17-31, is right that Vermont had no Indian wars except as adjuncts of imperial wars, and that it is hard to imagine "how empty the country was" from the white perspective (p. 22). Roth expresses the opposite view in *The Democratic Dilemma*: "The [Connecticut] valley remained a violent place for many years" after 1764 (p. 15). Compare Earle

Newton, The Vermont Story (Montpelier: Vermont Historical Society, 1949), 35.

<sup>43</sup> Perkins, Narrative, 32. The references to Keyes in the Index to the Contents of the Vermont Historical Gazetteer (Rutland, Vt.: Tuttle, 1923) indicate his character.

44 Perkins, Narrative, 27.

<sup>45</sup> William J. Gilmore, Reading Becomes a Necessity of Life: Material and Cultural Life in Rural New England, 1780–1835 (Knoxville: University of Tennessee Press, 1989), establishes high literacy in southern Windsor County as indicative of similar levels in the surrounding region and assesses the significance of Bible reading in the cultural complex.

46 For example, "Father" Chester Wright of Montpelier, as mentioned in Daniel Pierce Thompson, History of the Town of Montpelier (Montpelier, Vt.: E. P. Walton, 1860), 130; and "Father" Simeon

Parmelee, in Memorial of Rev. Simeon Parmelee, D. D. (Boston: Beacon Press, 1882), 35.

47 Perkins, Narrative, 33.

<sup>48</sup> John E. Goodrich, "Immigration to Vermont: Was Immigration to Vermont Stimulated—and to What Extent—in the Years 1760–90 by Persecution on the Part of the 'Standing Order' in Massachusetts and Connecticut?" Vermont Review 1 (February 1907): 74.

<sup>49</sup> Comstock, Congregational Churches, 126. This is folklore telling a truth about eagerness to win the minister's lot but must be inaccurate for 1790, when steeples and their clocks were nonexistent,

watches were scarce, and time was told by the sun.

<sup>50</sup> See Walter Thompson Bogart, *The Vermont Lease Lands* (Montpelier: Vermont Historical Society, 1950), on the Episcopal endowment; J. C. Williams, *The History and Map of Danby, Vermont* (Rutland, Vt.: McLean and Robbins, 1869), 92-93, on Baptist Hezekiah Eastman as first settled minister of Danby.

51 Comstock, Congregational Churches, lists the ten as:

Jedediah Dewey	1763-1778	Bennington
Peter Powers	1765-1782	Newbury and Haverhill, N.H.
Jesse Goodell	1767-1769	Westminster
Joseph Bullen	1774-1785	Westminster
James Wellman	1768-1774	Windsor east parish
Abner Reeve	1770-1792	Brattleboro
Abner Reeve	1770-1774	Guilford
Samuel Whiting	1772-1809	Rockingham
Samuel Whiting	1773-1778	Chester
Clement Sumner	1773-1778	Thetford
Benejah Roots	1773-1787	West Rutland
Hezekiah Taylor	1774-1811	Newfane

Hezekian Taylor

17/4-1811

Newtane

The Literary Diary of Ezra Stiles, ed. Franklin B. Dexter, vol. 2 (New York: Scribner's, 1901), 404.

Sanders also served as the University of Vermont's president from 1800 to 1814. A sketch of his career by T. D. Seymour Bassett is in The University of Vermont: The First Two Hundred Years, ed. Robert V. Daniels (Burlington: University of Vermont, 1991), 11-14.

54 Perkins, Narrative, 20.